

European Employment Policy Observatory (EEPO)

EEPO Review Spring 2015: Upskilling unemployed adults The organisation, profiling and targeting of training provision

Spain

Written by Elvira Gonzalez Gago, Marcelo Segales Kirzner

Centro Estudios Económicos Tomillo, S.L. March 2015



EUROPEAN COMMISSION

Directorate DG Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion Unit C.1 – Europe 2020: Employment Policies: European Employment Strategy and Governance E-mail: empl-c1-unit@ec.europa.eu European Commission

B-1049 Brussels

European Employment Policy Observatory (EEPO)

EEPO Review Spring 2015: Upskilling unemployed adults The organisation, profiling and targeting of training provision

Spain

Directorate-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion European Employment Policy Observatory (EEPO)

Europe Direct is a service to help you find answers to your questions about the European Union.

Freephone number (*):

00 800 6 7 8 9 10 11

(*) The information given is free, as are most calls (though some operators, phone boxes or hotels may charge you).

LEGAL NOTICE

This document has been prepared for the European Commission however it reflects the views only of the authors, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

More information on the European Union is available on the Internet (http://www.europa.eu).

Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union, 2015

ISBN ABC 12345678

DOI 987654321

© European Union, 2015

Reproduction is authorised provided the source is acknowledged.

1 Introduction: overview of organization of training for unemployed adults 25-64 (funding, governance, providers)

Upskilling unemployed adults is one of the goals of the so-called training for employment subsystem (TES – subsistema de formación para el empleo), integrated in the system of professional qualifications and vocational education training (Sistema nacional de cualificaciones y formación profesional). The subsystem is defined as the group of actions and measures developed with the purpose of promoting and enhancing lifelong learning adapted to the labour market needs among firms and workers (employed and unemployed) (article 26 of the Employment Law 56/2003). The TES is part of the broader professional training system which also includes vocational education training (VET) activities. It is currently regulated through the Royal Decree-Law 4/2015 of 23 March which has recently reformed the former model based on the Royal Decree 395/2007. According to the new Royal Decree-Law, the reform responds to the need to increase the impact of the system as well as to improve its quality; situate it in a less intricate juridical framework, promote a more strategic multi-annual planning; link training contents with labour market needs; increase the diversification of courses and training providers and implement a sound monitoring and evaluation system. Although late, the economic crisis has been taken as an opportunity to implement deep changes in the way training for employment is provided.

The recent Royal Decree-Law 4/2015 has not introduced significant changes in the aims of the system compared to the former formulation; it mentions (article 2): boosting lifelong learning; providing workers with the competences needed to develop their working careers; contributing to increase labour productivity and firms' competitiveness; taking into account labour market needs, providing workers with the adequate competences and expertise; improving workers' employability, especially for those with greater difficulties integrating into the labour market; and, ensuring accreditation of the knowledge acquired. The organisation of the TES remains based around four areas: training demanded by firms (formación de demanda), including individual training leave of workers¹, thus addressed to employed workers; training provided by authorised agents (training companies) (called formación de oferta) targeted at both employed and unemployed workers; alternate training (formación en alternancia); and, support actions for reinforcing the training for the employment subsystem (including sectoral and multisectoral research on training needs, innovative methodologies to introduce lifelong learning, guidance actions, etc.). Activities helping to upskill unemployed adults are thus at the heart of the TES. Moreover, the reform has specifically included low-skilled unemployed as a priority group for addressing training actions (article 12), something which was not envisaged in the former model based on the Royal Decree 395/2007.

Changing the governance of the TES is the key element of the recently approved reform. According to the new Royal Decree-Law 4/2015, the new model let the system basically in the hands of the Public Employment Service (PES) thus, diminishing substantially the weight of social agents, both trade unions and employers associations. Nevertheless, their participation in the General Council of the Employment National System (*Consejo General del Sistema Nacional de Empleo*) (Royal Decree 1722/07), the consultant agency where the most relevant decisions on employment policies are taken, is guaranteed. It is comprised of representatives of the Public Administrations (at national and regional levels), workers and employers' representatives. In this context, the Training for Employment National Commission is responsible for the development of the TES. The most relevant changes have been related to the removal of the social agents in their role

¹ Firms can finance both training courses and training leaves of their workers

as training providers (eliminating the "*de facto*" monopoly of trade unions and employers), maintaining their role in the prospection, planning (now multi-annually) and scheduling of training activities (article 5). In this context, training provision is therefore limited to accredited training centres so competence is expected to increase. The Training for Employment Tripartite Foundation changes its denomination and now it is called Training for Employment *State* Foundation ("Fundación Estatal para la Formación en el Empleo") (additional disposition number 5) as the Public Employment Service now holds the majority in its management board to the detriment of workers and employers ´ representatives. The entity is still responsible for technically helping the Public Employment Service to design and implement this training for the employment subsystem. In particular the Foundation supports the PES in the conduct of proceedings, drafting motions and verifying subsidies.

Other changes introduced by the reform in 2015 are linked to the last 2012 labour market reform (Law 6/2012). In broad terms, they have aimed to reinforce lifelong learning programmes targeted at employed workers through the recognition of a 20 hour period of training leave applied to all workers with at least one year of seniority, the possibility to introduce an individual training account for workers, etc.

Finally, the reform also stresses the introduction of a multi-annual planning for all Public Administrations (at national and regional level). The complete budget for the operation of the subsystem is now to be granted by competitive tendering (up to now it used to involve 50 %). A training voucher system (*cheque-formación*) for unemployed workers shall be promoted in cooperation with the regional employment authorities (additional disposition number 2) that will allow them to choose the provider that better meet their training needs. Tele-training is also boosted. A comprehensive information system linked to more efforts in monitoring and impact evaluation are emphasised while a specific unit within the National Labour Inspectorate with the purpose of checking the implementation of activities shall be created.

Training for the unemployed consists of courses of generally between 100 and 1 000 hours aimed at facilitating participants' integration into the labour market. Two stakeholders are in charge of their provision: third sector organisations and private training providers which have to be specifically authorised or accredited by the regional employment services. Financial incentives are available for participants: daily allowances for transport, grants for disabled people, among others. They are targeted at all officially registered unemployed people, particularly those harder to help, although in many courses compulsory qualifications are pre-required. Courses usually relate to the acquisition of a diploma which accredits a certain level of gualification included in the common national catalogue of professional gualifications². In that case, the courses are articulated through competence units ("unidades de competencia") which are in turn integrated by different training modules ("módulos formativos") with the aim of facilitating the partial accreditation of the training received. In this process, unemployed workers are able to improve their competences and accredit them at national level. However, courses may not be related to professional certifications but they may be connected with specific sectoral or intersectoral plans.

According to the Public Employment Service, the budget for upskilling unemployed people (including unemployed individuals aged less than 25) in 2015 amounted to EUR 801.4 million. This represents a 26 % increase compared to 2014. According to the

 $^{^2}$ Currently, 664 official professional qualifications are included belonging to 26 professional groupings (agrarian, food, chemical, health, security and environment, etc.) and five levels (from basic to expert level).

Ministry of Employment (2013 Statistical Yearbook), 75 % of the resources were allocated to the regional governments and the total amount of participants who finished their training courses mainly targeted at unemployed workers was 223 284 (4.7 % of total officially registered unemployed in December 2013). Among them, 183 072 were aged 25 or over (11 % less than in 2012 and 10 % below 2010 figures). The system is funded mainly through the workers' contributions (87 %)³ (2013).

2 Targeting provision to specific unemployed groups: detailed description of training provision

2.1 Access for unemployed adults to training programmes

Unemployed adults who want to join a training course need to request a visit to the regional Public Employment Service Office. There, an interview with the guidance and intermediation technical staff is arranged in order to create an individual profile for the person. This exercise takes into account the features of the unemployed candidate: his/her skills, labour experience, expectations, preferences, interests, etc. The guidance and intermediation technical staff suggests the most adequate training courses readily available for increasing the unemployed probabilities to find a job according to the information he/she has provided and accredited (in case of his/her qualifications, for instance). In any case, unemployment adults who apply for a training course should meet the following requirements: be registered as unemployed in the Public Employment Service office; include in their employment demand document their preferred training courses and their availability; meet the minimum requirements of the specific courses they want to join; pass a selection process, if necessary. The recently approved reform in March 2015 mentions the possibility to introduce training vouchers to encourage that unemployed workers apply for training courses and choose the providers that suit better their needs.

The information on the contents, length and intensity (amount of hours per week) and training provider, among others, is made available to the candidate so he/she can make the decision. Where a specific course is overbooked, the training provider can make an additional selection of candidates according to the profile elaborated by the Public Employment Service, and set up an additional course for them. If the jobseeker refuses to participate in a training course without a justified reason, the unemployment benefit may be temporarily or indefinitely suspended.

2.2 The provision of specific training paths

Training for employment actions are targeted at all officially registered unemployed people. The obligation of the PES is to develop an individual training pathway for all unemployed people, - this is, in practice, a difficult task. According to the Royal Decree 395/2007 training of particular groups of workers were highlighted: women, young people, disabled people, victims of gender violence and terrorism, long-term unemployed, people over 45 and people at risk of social exclusion. However, the new reformed text does not mention any harder-to-help group in particular leaving the multi-annual training for the employment plans to identify those groups as objects of priority action. In any case, it does declare that low-skilled unemployed workers constitute a general priority (article 12), in contrast to the Royal Decree 395/2007 in which they were not included. In particular, harder-to-help unemployed workers participating in specific programmes which combine active and passive labour market policies such as the

³They represent 0.7 % of salaries.

Prepara Programme⁴, the recently approved Activation Employment Programme⁵ or a minimum income scheme⁶, are sometimes included in individual training pathways. For instance, of the 12 908 new participants of the minimum income scheme in the Madrid Region in 2013, 2 795 of them were included in individual employment pathways. All participants have to subscribe to active engagement which commits them to accept an adequate job offer and participate in active labour market programmes proposed by the Public Employment Service in their respective regions. However, the coverage of training among these workers is very low (7 % in case of *Prepara* Programme participants), making the obligation more theoretical than real and the link between active and passive labour market policies still marginal.

Specific collectives at risk of exclusion (disabled people, ethnic minorities, etc.) are also involved in training programmes managed by third sector organisations with expertise in the issue and frequently funded by the ESF. That is the case of the Roma population (see case 1: *Acceder* Programme) or disabled people (see case 2: *Por Talento* Programme). According to Cidec (2012), social exclusion factors contribute to a reduction in the probability of participating in training for employment activities: while 30 % of people with VET skills have never been enrolled, this proportion soars to 78 % among those who do not have any education diploma. Lack of information about the programmes is the main reason behind it. The insertion rate of people at risk of social exclusion is slightly lower than that of the rest of jobseekers (46 % and 37 % respectively)⁷.

According to data available (Ministry of Employment Statistical Yearbook 2013), only 4.7% of unemployed participated in training courses in 2013 (4.6 % and 4.9 % of unemployed men and women respectively). Among unemployed adults (25 to 64), the proportion reached 4.3 % in 2013, which means that young unemployed are over-represented; women represented 54 %, after an increase of six percentage points since 2011. Young people (16 to 30) represented 33 % of all participants, five percentage points less than in 2011. Older workers (aged 45 or over) represented 27 % of the total

⁴ The *Prepara* programme aims to support income of long-term jobseekers (at least 12 months) no longer entitled to unemployment benefits, while promoting their employability. It was implemented in 2011 (RDL 1/2011) entitling long term job seekers to a six-month period of payments (EUR 399.38 monthly), linked with training and counseling actions. Responding to the difficulties of families with children, in August 2012, the amount was increased to EUR 452.63 monthly where the jobseeker has three or more dependents. It improves coordination between passive and active policies. Data released by the Ministry for Employment highlight that around 1 million people have participated in the programme since its beginning and that some 200 000 persons were effectively receiving it as for July 2012 (latest data released). Beneficiaries are mainly middle-aged and older lowly-skilled men with family responsibilities. A strong feature of the Prepara is that it is exclusively addressed to long-term unemployed with no or low incomes. The participation in Prepara activates participants: a pre-requisite for the unemployed to join the programme is to prove that s/he has tried to arrange three job interviews, has sent CVs, etc. This encourages them to do it and, frequently, to ask for help, which they would not have done otherwise. However, only 7 % of the total beneficiaries have been included in training actions (still almost doubling the proportion among the rest of Spanish unemployed people).

⁵ The new **Employment Activation Programme** (EAP) ("*Programa de Activación para el Empleo*" in Spanish) approved in December 2014 aims to sustain family income and activate the beneficiaries. It is addressed to registered unemployed who have exhausted any non-contributory unemployment benefit at least six months before (including the active insertion income (*RAI*)⁵, the *PRODI* and the *Prepara* Programmes). Beneficiaries should have family responsibilities and household income must be lower than 75 % of the minimum wage (EUR 486.45 in 2015). The beneficiaries have to subscribe the activation engagement (*compromiso de activación*).

⁶ The recipients of minimum income schemes may participate in integrated employment pathways which include the development of training courses. They are usually aimed at improving participants' pre-labour competences.

⁷ According to PES (2011), the insertion rate of the participants of training courses addressed to unemployed people amounted to 46 %.

adult unemployed participants (four percentage points above the 2011 level). According to their skill level, only 2 % of the participants were low-skilled which accounts for half their representation among all unemployed in 2011. This proportion is surprisingly low taking into account that one out of six unemployed workers have low skills, according to the Labour Force Survey. In contrast, 63 % of the participants have medium-skills while 34 % have post-obligatory qualifications (half of them have tertiary studies). All in all, regardless of the initial level, the proportion of unemployed workers who join the training courses is very low.

2.3 Length and types of training programmes

Training programmes usually encompass classroom and distance-based training (Public Employment Service, 2011). Training programmes leading to a diploma offer additionally internships in firms. The length of the courses varies widely. According to an evaluation impact report of the PES (2011), the mean length was 304.9 hours. No comparable data is available for 2013; however, half of the courses lasted no longer than 200 hours. Their importance had more than double since 2011, when they only represented 22 % of the total courses directed at unemployed workers. In contrast, only 8 % of the courses took more than 600 hours, half of the 2011 proportion. Women were underrepresented amongst participants enrolled in longer courses. The ratio of participants per course was 13.81, 0.6 % higher than in 2011.

Training contents are articulated by modules and levels within each professional family. Among the current 26 families currently existing, 59 % of participants were enrolled in four of them: administration and management, socio-cultural and community services, hostels and tourism, and computing and communications. In broad terms, courses may be classified in two types: those leading to a professional certification or those which does not. The first group of courses (26.6 % of total unemployed participants⁸) are articulated through competence units and usually last between 120 (domestic employment) and 1 030 hours (restaurant management). The professional certificate is acquired by completing it with additional internship hours at firm level (spanning generally between 40 and 120 hours and not involving any employment relationship). For instance, the human resources management programme is included in the management and administration professional grouping. It involves a 670 hour course structured in four competence units. It is linked to a certain professional competence (according to the Royal Decree 1210/2009)⁹ and to specific jobs. The content of each professional certificate as well as the requirements to become training providers are specifically detailed in the State Official Bulletin (BOE). In contrast, courses which do not lead to a professional certificate are not structured in modules although this does not mean that they are shorter or related to more general competences. In any case, each of the 26 professional groupings includes both types of courses. According to the PES (2011), 46 % of people participating in training for employment courses had been integrated into the labour market.

2.4 Role of actors and main providers

Actors participating in training for employment provision are mainly the Public Employment Service (PES), the regional employment authorities, the State (formerly called "Tripartite") Training for Employment Foundation, social agents (employers and workers' representatives) and other public and private entities (such as the Chambers of Commerce, NGOs and training providers).

⁸ Public Employment Service (2011).

⁹ Administrative management of the human resources at company level according to the normative in force.

The recently approved reform removes social agents from training provision and maintains their role in the definition of the contents of the training courses. These are established through sectoral and territorial clusters where programming roundtables (estructuras paritarias sectoriales) with workers and employers' representatives gather to anticipate skill needs and discuss the various training needs of their territories. The Regional Employment Observatories (with more or less activity depending on the region) also play a role in the definition of those contents, supporting these roundtables at sector level with workers and employers representatives in which training for the short and midterm is planned. Moreover, National Reference Centres¹⁰ and Regional Training Integrated Centres¹¹ also contribute to configure the contents of training programmes thanks to the implementation of pilot programmes which, once they have been implemented, are then transferred to the rest of the education providers. The State Training for Employment Foundation (former Tripartite) ("Fundación Estatal para la formación en el empleo", article 27 of the reform), whose board includes PES members and workers and employers' representatives, provides support to the PES in the definition and configuration of the training for employment system.

Training providers are now exclusively responsible for training provision. Those centres which want to develop training for employment courses have to apply for authorisation to the Public Employment Service (PES) at national level linked to the specific training areas the entity is specialised in and the facilities they have. In case the courses provided lead to a professional certificate, the training provider must apply for a special accreditation. Their authorisation and monitoring is in the hands of the regional employment authorities (generally under the Directorate General of Training for the Employment), according to minimum requirements established in the Order TAS 718/2008. The final decision corresponds, then, to the criteria established by the regional employment offices. For instance, the selection criteria for training providers for the Madrid Regional Employment service involves their level of previous experience and the level of satisfaction of their former trainees. The Servei d'Ocupacio Catalán (SOC - Catalonian Employment Service), however, considers the previous insertion rates and the adequacy of the training contents to the labour market needs (according to the anticipated skill needs derived from the programming roundtables within the correspondent territory). In this context, the regional employment authority also determines the financing of each training programme.

Finally, as it has been mentioned, third sector entities, experts in the assistance of people at risk of exclusion, manage programmes which frequently include training courses addressed to harder-to-help groups within the labour market (see cases).

2.5 Existing evaluation of the effectiveness of training measures

Detailed information about the performance of the training for employment subsystem (TES) is scarce. Quantitative figures are frequently insufficient, not up-to-date (the last attempt to provide a comprehensive evaluation was in 2011) or simply missing. This insufficiency of data makes a sound assessment difficult. Moreover, the indicators included in the last Employment Policy Annual Plan (PAPE) 2014 have plenty of room for improvement in order to produce evaluations of the efficacy of the training for

¹⁰ According to the Royal Decree 229/2008, they are specific centres aimed at programming and implementing innovative contents linked to their exclusive competences, taken as a reference for the rest of training providers. They are articulated in a nationwide network of Reference Centres.

¹¹ According to the Royal Decree 1558/2005, they are special training centres where both subsystems (VET training for employment) are integrated. They are authorised to provide all the courses leading to professional certificates. They also include guidance services for unemployed workers.

employment subsystem, the extent to which the courses contribute to the integration of unemployed workers, the effect on harder-to-help groups, etc. On the contrary, the PAPE 2014 indicators focus on monitoring the amount of participants, their satisfaction level with the courses they have enrolled in and the proportion of courses leading to official certifications. Although they theoretically include information about the coverage rate of training among unemployed people and the proportion of courses related to innovative sectors (Royal Decree 395/2007), this is insufficient to provide an adequate evaluation of the connection between the TES and labour market needs, the value added of training for improving the employability of harder-to-help collectives, etc. Furthermore, and more surprisingly, the figures related to the indicators mentioned have not been made public since 2011. The Royal Decree-Law 4/2015 stresses the role of monitoring and impact evaluation. It includes a comprehensive information system gathering the individual's participation in training activities (the so-called training account or "cuenta de formación") and an annual impact evaluation plan of the training courses, taking into account the insertion rates of unemployed participants.

The most comprehensive effort to evaluate the training for employment subsystem (including training for occupied workers) has been the impact evaluation report released in 2011 (2010 data). Indicators refer to five fields: quality, realisation, efficacy, efficiency and impact. All in all, they include the amount of participants, mean length of the courses, the proportion of participants who found a job while they were enrolled in a course, the cost per participant and hour, the proportion of participants enrolled in accredited courses, etc. (see next table). However, information about deadweight and displacement effects, to what extent the courses did have an influence on the insertion rates, the use of control and experimental groups, etc., is missing. The report has not been updated and, although the new training for employment model insists on the relevance of evaluation to improve the efficacy and the quality of the training provided, no further information has been made public on this issue.

Indicator	Value
Proportion of courses leading to professional diplomas	33.1 %
Proportion of participants in courses leading to professional diplomas	26.6 %
Mean length of the courses	304.9 hours
Multi-participation rate	1.22 courses per participant
Drop-out rate due to incorporation into the labour market	5.7 %
Completion rate	98.1 %
Cost per participant	EUR 7.05 per hour
Insertion rate	46 %

Table 1.Evaluation of the training for employment subsystem (2011)

Source: PES (2011).

Finally, some researchers have made attempts to evaluate the efficacy of the upskilling unemployment activities. However, the number of papers is low.

Based on a logit model, Saez (2004) found that participants in training actions have initially lower chances of integrating into the labour market and that the training courses do not significantly modify this.

Research aimed at estimating the labour market incorporation of training programmes participants in the Madrid Region was conducted by the University Carlos III (2005). The research found that women and older people had lower probabilities of finding a job after completing a training programme. Unemployed receiving the unemployment benefit and those who enrolled in VET studies were more likely to find a job after a training course.

According to Arellano (2010), who also studied the efficacy of training on tackling gender inequalities within the labour market, participating in training programmes 'reduces unemployment duration but does not eliminate gender segregation in the labour market because women only benefit slightly more from the courses than men.' Participants in medium-level courses have more positive results.

3 Most significant practices

CASE STUDY 1: FUNDACIÓN SECRETARIADO GITANO: ACCEDER PROGRAMME

Country: Spain

Name of training programme: Acceder Programme (To access Programme)

Short description and aims of the training programme: It encompasses a comprehensive programme for up-skilling and integrating Roma people into the labour market through individual employment pathways, which especially include training, placement and entrepreneurship activities in the context of the ESF funding. It is based on an individualised, intercultural and multidimensional approach in which each participant is the subject of a detailed profile. A socio-educative and family intervention is also included. Training encompasses basic skills and more specialised occupational courses. The programme is aimed at upskilling Roma people and re-incorporating them into the labour market, whilst contributing to adapting training for employment courses for Roma people 's needs, as well as assessing Roma entrepreneurs to become self-employed, raising awareness of Roma people 's needs (particularly women), and reinforcing ALMP focused on Roma people. Raising awareness material and specific methodological documents are also elaborated. The Acceder Programme is addressed both to adults (76 % in 2009) and to young people (aged less than 25, 24 % in 2009).

Target group: Roma people

Number of participants: 64 246 (December 2011)

Duration of programme for the beneficiary (and amount of subsidy beneficiaries receive, if applicable): 2000-2014

Target group or educational level targeted: Low-skilled

Funding source and total budget (share of EU funding, if applicable): EUR 114.4 million (including ESF)

Types of skills (or qualification if relevant) delivered: 1 601 training courses and 15 802 participants (81 % Roma people, 58 % women) leading to professional certificates adapted to the needs of the participants (generally low skilled), focusing on short training courses with high insertion rates.

Actors involved in the provision of training and their role: Third sector entities specialised in the assistance of Roma and other socially excluded collectives (mainly the Roma Secretariat Foundation).

Summary of evaluation findings: 43 802 employment contracts have been signed

by participants and 112 participants have become self-employed, who, as a whole, have created 162 jobs by December 2011.

Policy lessons: it is important to consider employment exclusion as a multidimensional phenomenon; gender equality must be transversal to all the actions included in any employment programme; individual pathways for employment should adapt to the features of the people to whom they are addressed to; and, the monitoring of the participants should not finish when participants find their job after completing the individual pathway.

References (including weblinks to published evaluation studies): https://www.gitanos.org/quehacemos/areas/empleo_y_formacion_profesional/acceder.html

http://epic.programaeurosocial.eu/files/2-ficha-completa.pdf

CASE STUDY 2: POR TALENTO PROGRAMME

Country: Spain

Name of training programme: X Talento (Through Talent)

Short description and aims of the training programme: the programme is aimed at reinforcing the employability of disabled people - this is one of the more harder-to-help groups within the Spanish labour market. It includes raising awareness activities to attract disabled people to the labour market; the implementation of training programmes specifically designed to improve their employability, start-up initiatives, social economy promotion and job placement activities.

Target group: Disabled people

Number of participants: 197 775 participants (up to 2012)

Duration of programme for the beneficiary (and amount of subsidy beneficiaries receive, if applicable): 2009-2013

Target group or educational level targeted: Disabled people

Eligibility Criteria: having a disability according to the regional or local social services department

Funding source and total budget (share of EU funding, if applicable): not available

Types of skills (or qualification if relevant) delivered: 42 954 people have participated in 5 760 training courses. Training courses are classified into three groups: workshops for improving the employability of participants; training for employment; and complementary training (basic skills, languages and ICT). In 2013, 43 % of participants were enrolled in training for employment courses, 31 % in employability workshops and 26 % in complementary training courses.

Actors involved in the provision of training and their role: Third sector entities specialised in the assistance of disabled people (mainly the ONCE through the entity FSC¹²).

Summary of evaluation findings: 23 293 jobs have been created in 3 819 firms

¹² The National Organisation for Blind People (*Organización Nacional de Ciegos, ONCE*) is the largest third sector organization that works for blind people and also for people with other disabilities. It is composed of several companies, among which Fundosa Social Consulting (FSC), which manages the human resources of the group of companies.

between 2009 and 2013 (according to the data referred to 2013, 45 % of the jobs created were held by women who had participated in the programme).

Policy lessons: Interventions for harder-to-help collectives are more efficient when they integrate a variety of responses to the multidimensional problems of these groups. Services should range from assisting employers who want to join the programme and hire disabled people to the implementation of individual employment pathways to help people incorporate into the labour market. Training must not be detached from the rest of the measures. Alliances with firms, raising awareness campaigns and training are considered key to improve the labour market conditions and increase the chances for disabled people of finding a job.

References (including weblinks to published evaluation studies):

https://www.portalento.es/Paginas/Inicio.aspx

http://www.fsc-inserta.es/PorTalento/Paginas/Home.aspx

4 Conclusions

Based on the information provided by the Public Employment Service (PES) about the effectiveness and efficacy of the training for employment subsystem, some conclusions are highlighted in this section.

The training for employment subsystem has a very low impact among unemployed workers. The overall coverage rate was only 4.7 % in 2013, which means that less than one out of twenty unemployed individuals are involved in training actions. Whether this is due to the unwillingness of unemployed to enrol in courses or to insufficient provision of training places is unknown. While the unemployed must fulfil their obligations under the activation scheme in order to maintain receipt of their unemployment benefit payments (e.g. enrolling in a training course proposed by the PES), the scarce public budget available means that the provision of adequate and sufficient training places by the PES for the unemployed is only to a small extent fulfilled.

The long economic crisis has meant a missed opportunity to increase the coverage of training programmes for the unemployed, at least when they were still receiving unemployment benefits and they were still in touch with the Public Employment Service offices. On the one hand, millions of unemployed individuals coming from declining economic sectors could have been re-trained and a different economic model would have emerged. On the other hand, individuals with unfavourable employment prospects (as the economic crisis has proven) would have had a strong incentive to increase their employability and not lose other pre-labour competences, as it has finally happened.

Expenditure on training activities targeted at unemployed people covered only 15 % of the total ALMP budgetary effort in 2013. Training aimed at up-skilling jobseekers does not seem to be a strategic issue, especially in terms of spending, compared to employment incentives or training incumbent workers (36 % and 24 % of the total budget respectively). This is especially surprising taking into account the high amount of officially registered unemployed people (almost 5 million in 2013). This should also be situated in a more comprehensive context of the Spanish ALMP delivery. Compared to the rest of EU-28 countries, Spanish expenditure on training is lower in terms of the amount per participant: in 2011, it amounted to EUR 5 942, less than half of the figure in France (EUR 13 036), Austria (EUR 13 226) and three times less than Finland figures (EUR 15 421).

According to the available information provided by the Ministry of Employment Annual Statistical Yearbooks, the composition of people enrolled in training programmes concentrates on medium-skilled unemployed people (65 %). Only 2 % of the jobseekers participating in training activities have low skills, something very remarkable taking into account that 14 % of the total unemployed individuals have only finished primary studies. The coverage of low-gualified unemployed is thus even lower than the average, something which introduces higher disparities among gualified and non-gualified workers within the Spanish labour market, contributing to increased long-term unemployment, etc. This may be the effect of two elements: firstly, insufficient information on training courses among low-skilled unemployed workers; and, secondly, the training for the employment subsystem (Royal Decree 395/2007) did not define low-skilled unemployed as a priority collective. Nevertheless, according to some quantitative and qualitative research, training for the employment seems to have larger impacts on the probability to incorporate into the labour market of harder-to-help groups. In this context, the lower the qualification level of the participant of training programmes, the higher the positive effects of participation on the likelihood of labour market integration.

In spite of spending hundreds of million Euros (EUR 675m in 2014 and EUR 801m in 2015) and having an unemployment rate around 23-25 % during the same period, the efficacy of the training provision has not been thoroughly studied. To what extent enrolling in training courses leading to professional certifications contributes to positive outcomes in terms of labour market integration is unknown, although some incipient evaluations have been carried out. Neither the Public Employment Service nor the Quality and Evaluation Agency (AEVAL in Spanish) have committed to developing comprehensive impact evaluations of the subsystem. The National Public Employment Service does not disseminate the information it collects through the successive Employment Annual Policy Plans (PAPEs).

In March 2015, a comprehensive reform of the organisation and governance of the subsystem has been approved. Although a particular regulatory development is expected to be introduced in the subsequent months, some important features deserve to be mentioned. The strong presence of the social agents (workers and employers' representatives) in the provision of training has been dramatically changed with the implementation of the new model. As a result, the role of social agents is limited to planning and configuring the contents of training. In this context, the introduction of more competitive mechanisms is expected to increase competence among training providers, something which may contribute to increase the effectiveness of the training programmes, and thus affecting, in particular, the harder-to-help jobseekers. The multiyear planning may also help to determine more adequate training contents, better linked to labour market needs. The possibility to introduce a training voucher through which unemployed may be provided with training courses according to their needs and the provider they choose seems to be another positive element. Currently, the fact that 59 % of the training courses are concentrated in only four out of 26 professional groupings, apart from reflecting the Spanish economic model features, may also be a consequence of three elements: insufficient prospective analysis and anticipation of skill needs; lack of incentives for training providers to innovate and adapt to the labour market; and insufficient availability of training programmes at regional level (especially in small regions) may also be relevant.

The reform is thus welcome as long as these mechanisms result in the expected outcomes. However, a dramatic increase in the budget is unavoidable if an impact is to happen. Otherwise, all these changes will remain a good-will declaration. Too many low skilled persons have been unemployed for more than two years now without access to

appropriate (re) training opportunities. In light of the eventual recovery of the economy, more and more effective efforts are needed.

5 Bibliography

- European Commission, *Adapting PES training to better service demand*, 2012. Internet: http://ec.europa.eu/social/BlobServlet?docId=13382&langId=en
- Eurypedia The European Encyclopaedia on National Education Systems. Internet: http://eacea.ec.europa.eu/education/eurydice/eurypedia_en.php
- European Inventory on validation of non-formal and informal learning, update 2014. Internet: http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/events-andprojects/projects/validation-non formal-and-informal-learning/european-inventory
- DG EMPL database of LMP interventions which have been assessed in terms of their efficacy or impact, available at Internet: http://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=1080&langId=en
- Specific thematic reports on validation for specific target groups, from 2010 European Inventory, available at: Internet: https://cumulus.cedefop.europa.eu/files/vetelib/2011/77651.pdf
- Arellano (2010): Do training programmes get the unemployed back to work, Revista de Economia Aplicada 53, 2010, pp. 39-65 Internet: https://5fdedc2f-a-62cb3a1a-ssites.googlegroups.com/site/alfonsoarellano/Files/wp2505.pdf?attachauth=ANoY7c qXe-tEgSlbOp6bENDx8zrKFBFPOkbwzRvu8N9OoGpGkLlq38jdnHjroGKrbgMkTREWcMk-H_E_IDBBSHTx4j6_1uwYShhHbquDmHNuwOKh59mpBQNhjAUedKC2R0VOQVCaFt zQAo1FtkiJT82Z2ugigey_ESucKjcaMMO7_ekASS-3GuRI6PLCV1bhuwcFJ_qZ9DITE7xoj1LAcU8AOGNC_COwxAoZysniOcyKmDkUxGjLE Q%3D&attredirects=0
- BOCM (2014): Order 16140/2014 through which subsidies for training providers are called for 2014.
- BOE (2005): ""Royal Decree Law 1558/2005".
- BOE (2007): "Royal Decree Law 395/2007".
- BOE (2008): "Royal Decree Law 229/2008".
- BOE (2014): Resolution of 16th September through which the Employment Policy Annual Plan 2014 is approved.
- BOE (2015): "Royal Decree Law 4/2015".
- CIDEC (2012): "Training and social exclusion: synthesis Report", Madrid, Public Employment Service. Internet: http://www.sepe.es/LegislativaWeb/verFichero.do?fichero=09017edb8011f10c
- Comunidad de Madrid (2013): Minimum income scheme report 2013. Internet: http://www.madrid.org/cs/Satellite?blobcol=urldata&blobheader=application%2Fp df&blobheadername1=Content-Disposition&blobheadervalue1=filename%3DBALANCE_ANUAL_DE_GESTI%C3%9 3N_DE_LA_RMI_2013.pdf&blobkey=id&blobtable=MungoBlobs&blobwhere=13528 56501363&ssbinary=true
- DOGC (2014): Order EMO 314/2014 through which subsidies for training providers are called for 2014.
- FSC (2013): *Por Talento* Programme: *2013 Report*. Internet: https://www.portalento.es/portalento/documentacion/Paginas/memorias.aspx

- Ministry of Employment and Social Security (2013): *Minimum income schemes report 2013.* Internet: http://www.msssi.gob.es/ssi/familiasInfancia/inclusionSocial/serviciosSociales/Ren tasMinimas/Docs/Informe_2013.pdf
- The Ministry of Employment Statistical Yearbook, 2013. Internet: http://www.empleo.gob.es/estadisticas/ANUARIO2013/index.htm
- PES (2011): Impact evaluation report of the training for employment subsystem: executive summary. Internet: https://www.sistemanacionalempleo.es/pdf/planFPE.pdf
- Roma People Secretariat Foundation (2013): Acceder Programme: training for employment addressed to harder-to-help people: the experience of the Roma People Secretariat Foundation. Internet: https://www.gitanos.org/que-hacemos/areas/empleo_y_formacion_profesional/acceder.html
- Saéz, F. (2004): Training for employment: an evaluation, Cuadernos de Economía, Vol. 27, pp. 147-174. Internet: https://www.uam.es/personal_pdi/economicas/ainhoahe/pdf/papers/2004_herrart e_saez.pdfUniversity Carlos III (2005), The estimation of an labour market insertion function to improve the planning of the training for employment training services provided by the Madrid Regional Employment Service (executive report), Madrid, 4th October 2005. Internet: http://www.emprendelo.es/cs/Satellite?blobcol=urldata&blobheader=application% 2Fpdf&blobheadername1=Content-

Disposition&blobheadervalue1=filename%3DModelo+de+programaci%C3%B3n+d e+cursos+del+S.R.E.pdf&blobkey=id&blobtable=MungoBlobs&blobwhere=111914 7809512&ssbinary=true

Annex 1: Measure Description Table

Main training programmes in SPAIN

Table title: Name of training progra mme	name and number of the relevant LMP measure, based on the list of LMP measures in the qualitative LMP report (if possible to attribute the training	Short description and aims of the training programme: e.g. basic skills(literacy, numeracy, ICT, other skills); general work experience and employability skills; initial vocational training oriented to a specific job; continuing training to up/re-skill in own occupation/sector; validation of prior learning and experience; tertiary education; preparation to start own business, etc.	No. of participants	Duration of programme for the beneficiary (and amount of subsidy, if applicable)	Target group or educational level targeted	Criteria for accessing the programme	Funding source and total budget	Types of skills (or qualification if relevant) delivered	Actors involved in training provision and their role
Program mes leading to professio nal certificati ons	2.1 Institutional training	Training is aimed at recycling unemployed people and providing a diploma valid at national level	53 594 (26.6 % of 223 284)	Between 120 and 1 030 hours	Generally, participants must have the obligatory secondary school diploma	Access usually depends on the unemployed profile elaborated in the Public Employment Service Office	General budget	Skills are classified in 26 professional families covering the whole Spanish economic structure	After the reform introduced in March 2015, private training centres are exclusively responsible for training provision. They have to be inscribed in the correspondent register even in case the courses are not included in the Training Specialities Catalogue. In – case the training courses lead to professional certificates, training centres should not only be inscribed but also accredited by the Public Employment Service at regional level and they have to fulfil certain solvency requirements (arts. 15 and 16 of the RDL 4/2015).
Program mes not leading to professio nal certificati ons	2.1 Institutional training	Training is aimed at recycling unemployed people though it does not provide a diploma valid at national level	169,690 (73.3 % of 223 284)	Between 120 and 950 hours	Generally, participants must have the obligatory secondary school diploma	Access usually depends on the unemployed profile elaborated in the Public Employment Service Office	General budget	Skills are classified in 26 professional groupings covering the whole of the Spanish economic structure. Complementary skills are included (ICT, language, etc.)	
Measures specifically targeting the low-skilled									
Measures specifically targeting the long-term unemployed									
Prepara Program me	8.1.2 Unemployment assistance	Training is aimed at providing basic pre-labour and labour skills specifically targeted at the long-term unemployed who have not been in touch with the labour market for the previous 12 months		Unknown	Long-term unemployed workers (generally low- skilled)	It is a means- tested programme (EUR 486 – 75 % of the minimum wage)	General Budget	Basic skills	In addition to private training centres, training provision included in programmes aimed at improving the employability of long-term unemployed are also developed by NGOs specialized in the assistance of specific collectives.
Minimum income schemes	8.1.2 Unemployment assistance	Training is provided through the individual employment pathways and the social and labour market integration projects ("proyectos de inserción sociolaboral")	240252receivedtheminimumincomein2013(theproportionofparticipantsoftrainingisunknown)	Unknown	Low-skilled unemployed workers (generally low- skilled)	It is a means- tested programme (EUR 486 – 75 % of the minimum wage)	General Budget	Basic skills	In addition to private training centres, training provision included in programmes aimed at improving the employability of long-term unemployed are also developed by NGOs specialized in the assistance of specific collectives.

Evaluation results If no evaluation is available (here, please provide detail on the the expert's method used, on the assessment of the coverage, and on the impact of the evaluation findings) measure?

HOW TO OBTAIN EU PUBLICATIONS

Free publications:

• one copy:

via EU Bookshop (http://bookshop.europa.eu);

 more than one copy or posters/maps: from the European Union's representations (http://ec.europa.eu/represent_en.htm); from the delegations in non-EU countries (http://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/index_en.htm); by contacting the Europe Direct service (http://europa.eu/europedirect/index_en.htm) or calling 00 800 6 7 8 9 10 11 (freephone number from anywhere in the EU) (*).

(*) The information given is free, as are most calls (though some operators, phone boxes or hotels may charge you).

Priced publications:

• via EU Bookshop (http://bookshop.europa.eu).

Priced subscriptions:

 via one of the sales agents of the Publications Office of the European Union (http://publications.europa.eu/others/agents/index_en.htm).



